

# Logic I: Lecture 10

s.butterfill@warwick.ac.uk

Readings refer to sections of the course textbook, *Language, Proof and Logic*.

## 1. What does '→' mean?

Reading: §7.1

Assuming that the rules of Fitch are such that it is impossible to prove an argument which is not logically valid, the truth table for → is fixed if we accept →Elim and →Intro.

How do the rules of proof for → fix its truth table?

A	B	A → B
T	T	?
T	F	?
F	T	?
F	F	?

## 2. Not If

If she has seen it, I am dead.

$A \rightarrow B$

That's not true.

$\neg(A \rightarrow B)$

If she has seen it, I am not dead.

$A \rightarrow \neg B$

A	B	$A \rightarrow B$	$\neg(A \rightarrow B)$	$A \rightarrow \neg B$
T	T	T	F	F
T	F	F	T	T
F	T	T	F	T
F	F	T	F	T

## 3. Fubar Rules

Reading: §8.3

Consider this made-up rule:

∧Fubar:  
 $\begin{array}{|l} * \\ \dots \\ * \wedge \# \end{array}$

Q1. What would be wrong with adding ∧Fubar to Fitch?

Q2. What would be wrong with having ∧Fubar in any system of proof?

## 4. ↔ : truth tables and rules

A	B	$A \leftrightarrow B$
T	T	T
T	F	F
F	T	F
F	F	T

**Biconditional Elimination**  
 (↔ Elim)

$\begin{array}{|l} P \leftrightarrow Q \text{ (or } Q \leftrightarrow P) \\ \vdots \\ P \\ \vdots \\ Q \end{array}$

**Biconditional Introduction**  
 (↔ Intro)

$\begin{array}{|l} P \\ \vdots \\ Q \\ \vdots \\ P \end{array}$ 
  
 $\triangleright P \leftrightarrow Q$

## 5. Translation with Quantifiers

Reading: §9.5, §9.6

All discordians weep:

$$\forall x( \text{Dscrdn}(x) \rightarrow \text{Wps}(x) )$$

All **quadrumanous** discordians weep:

$$\forall x( ( \text{Quadr}(x) \wedge \text{Dscrdn}(x) ) \rightarrow \text{Wps}(x) )$$

All quadrumanous discordians weep **and wail**:

$$\forall x( ( \text{Quadr}(x) \wedge \text{Dscrdn}(x) ) \rightarrow ( \text{Wps}(x) \wedge \text{Wls}(x) ) )$$

All quadrumanous discordians weep and wail **except Gillian Deleude**:

$$\forall x( ( \text{Quadr}(x) \wedge \text{Dscrdn}(x) \wedge \neg(x=a) ) \rightarrow ( \text{Wps}(x) \wedge \text{Wls}(x) ) )$$

## 6. $\exists$ Intro

Reading: §13.2

**Disjunction Introduction**  
( $\vee$  Intro)

$$\begin{array}{|l} P_i \\ \vdots \\ P_1 \vee \dots \vee P_i \vee \dots \vee P_n \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{|l} 4. \text{ YelBk}(a) \\ 5. \exists x \text{ YelBk}(x) \end{array}$$

## 7. What does $\exists$ mean?

Reading: §9.4

We give the meaning of  $\exists$  by specifying what it takes for a sentence containing  $\exists$  to be true:

1. Give every object a name.
2. For each name in turn, create a new sentence like this: delete the quantifier and replace all instances of the variable it binds with that name.
3. If ANY of the new sentences are true, so is the original sentence.

## 8. There Does Not Exist

Something is not dead:

$$\exists x \neg \text{Dead}(x)$$

Nothing is dead:

$$\neg \exists x \text{ Dead}(x)$$

Everything is not broken:

$$\forall x \neg \text{Broken}(x)$$

Not everything is broken:

$$\neg \forall x \text{ Broken}(x)$$

$$\begin{array}{|l} 1. \\ 2. a=a \quad =\text{Intro} \\ 3. \exists x (x=x) \quad \exists\text{Intro: 2} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{|l} 1. \neg \exists x \text{ Dead}(x) \\ 2. \text{ Dead}(a) \\ 3. \exists x \text{ Dead}(x) \quad \exists\text{Intro: 2} \\ 4. \perp \quad \perp\text{Intro: 1,3} \\ 5. \neg \text{Dead}(a) \quad \neg\text{Intro: 2-4} \\ 6. \exists x \neg \text{Dead}(x) \quad \exists\text{Intro: 5} \end{array}$$

## 9. Quantifier Equivalences: $\neg \forall x \text{ Created}(x) \models \exists x \neg \text{Created}(x)$

Reading: §10.1, §10.3, §10.4